

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday, June 25, 2012 12:00 noon

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Alice Allen called the meeting to order.

Roll Call.

Alice Allen, Chair

Bert Bender

Jim Clupper

Stephanie Scuderi, absent

Donna Bosold, absent

Staff: Pedro Mercado, Assistant County Attorney

Rey Ortiz, Planner

Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of Minutes from the May 7, 2012

Bert Bender motioned to approve the minutes for the May 7, 2012 meeting. Jim Clupper seconded the motion.

12:00-2:00 Workshop on Design Guidelines

Alice Allen said she reviewed Bert Bender's Flagstaff Development Standards. We should discuss if zones should be created in the district. She asked Bert if this plan was implemented in Flagstaff.

Bert Bender said they did enforce these Standards. He noted most of the historic houses here are small. There are many ways to address these. We may want to look at Tavernier as one zone.

Ms. Allen said she has lived in Tavernier since 1939. The commercial corridor has two distinct ends. She sees zones for 1950's- 1960's, 1970's-1990's homes, and for the very historic. The question is can we actually establish zones.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, June 25, 2012 12:00 noon

Tavernier Fire House

Page 2 of 9

Mr. Bender noted the guidelines need to better explain scale in relationship to the historic neighborhood.

Bert Bender explained Tavernier is a fairly new district. People complain that their neighbor could do it so why can't I. The guidelines need to better explain there are a number of ways to solve problems. They should not dictate and say "must". We need to better explain scale, rhythm, and massing. Perhaps we should write a preamble to the guidelines.

Alice Allen asked can we apply the concept of development zones here.

Mr. Bender noted Flagstaff had a regular street grid, while Tavernier does not.

Richard Agler asked if they were talking about taking the historic district and creating zones.

Ms. Allen explained we are looking at something Bert did years ago.

Mr. Bender said we were looking at new construction infill.

Ms. Allen said we can discuss this and make recommendations but this will have to go to the County Commission and the people to make any changes.

Cynthia Martin said she has been working on her house for three years. She bought it in 1999 and did not know it was in a historic district. She feels residents should have been notified. Some of her neighbors want it to be historic so they can build back, or they would not be able to re-build without a variance. One of her neighbors has such a tiny house, it must have had an out-house. It is for a single person not a family.

Ms. Allen said Tavernier never had out-houses. They had water piped in from a cistern.

Ms. Martin said many of these houses are very small. What can people do to make these homes livable for today's families? Many people drive by and ask her where the historic district is.

Mindy Agler said people are going to leave if they cannot adapt their houses.

Mr. Bender explained the Secretary of the Interior's Standards address appropriate changes to historic buildings. It does not say you cannot enlarge it. It says the addition should be respectful and compatible with the historic house.

Ms. Eklom said she has a 750 square foot house and they cannot add on because it is set so far back on the lot. They do not have the 10 foot setback required behind the house. It was built in 1941.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, June 25, 2012 12:00 noon

Tavernier Fire House

Page 3 of 9

Mr. Bender said he would like to see Alice's idea of what the zones should be as she is the most familiar with the district.

Jim Clupper pointed out that a lot of people have misconceptions about the Historic District. He agreed with Bert that we should write a preamble to the guidelines rather than rewrite the guidelines.

Mr. Bender said a preamble to clarify the guidelines and the inclusion of Chapter 11 of the Florida Building Code for Existing Buildings (2010) as an appendix, should be added to our existing guidelines.

All agreed this was a good idea. Jim offered to begin working on this.

2:00 pm Regular Meeting

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. ANDREW TOBIN is proposing to construct a new single family residence at 243 Tavernier Drive. The subject property is legally described as Block 8 Lot 7 Largo Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00477860-000000 (previously tabled at the March 5th and May 7th 2012 meetings).

Withdrawn from this agenda.

2. CAROLINE ALFONSO is seeking approval for a new front deck as a replacement for a previous, smaller, front deck. The subject property located at 120 Sunrise Drive and is legally described as Lot 45 Tavernier Cove, NO 1 PB1-103 Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00506380-000000. (Previously tabled at the May 7th meeting).

Applicant presentation of new material

Rodolfo Perez had submitted drawings of the deck railing and photos of houses with similar decks and railings. The railing will be 30" high with 4" X 4" posts.

Public testimony

Cynthia Martin and Mindy Agler both felt this deck and railing would look nice.

Board discussion

Mr. Bender asked Rey Ortiz if these hand drawn illustrations would be acceptable to submit for permitting.

Mr. Ortiz said yes at present, but this may change in October.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve with the condition that if formal plans are required for permitting they will come back for review. Jim Clupper seconded the motion.

Ms. Allen said she has not changed her mind. This is a significant change to a historic building. We should not change the windshield view of historic homes.

Mr. Bender explained he shares her concern. He is pleased that the railing is low and simple. It will improve the looks of the deck.

Ms. Allen said it is the size of the deck.

Mr. Ortiz said they must follow the setbacks. They are here because they are increasing the deck size and adding railings.

Mr. Bender asked Pedro Mercado if the Commission could make them remove the deck.

Mr. Mercado said no.

A roll call vote was held. Bert Bender and Jim Clupper voted in favor of the motion. Alice Allen voted against. Therefore, the motion carried.

3. BALLAST TRAIL,LLC is proposing to construct a single family residence and to convert the existing Red Cross house into a guest house at 200 Ballast Trail. The subject property is legally described as Lots 4, 9, and 10 Tavernier, Island of Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Numbers: 00090220-000000; 00090230-000000; 00090230-000100; 00090260-000000; 00090270-000302; 00090270-000301.

The applicant had been sent a letter stating the meeting began at noon. The Commission agreed to hear it at that time and then continue this item after 2:00 pm so that any other interested members of the public could be present at the advertised time.

Staff presentation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable guidelines and standards.

Applicant presentation

Don Horton, Max Wilson Strang, Architect and his Associates, and Johanna and Alexandre Saverin (property owners) presented the project.

Mr. Strang said they plan to leave the hammock intact, limiting construction to the scarified portion of the property. He has combined contemporary and historic elements. He is using a berm instead of stilts to reduce the scale of the new house. The mechanical equipment will be screened by the sloped roofs.

Ms. Allen asked about the gravesite on the property.

Mr. Saverin said it will not be impacted.

Public testimony

Jamie Eklom said they just bought a house on Beach Road and asked if she could also build a new home. When we bought, the realtor told us it was a protected hammock and no one could ever build on it. She asked about the property access point.

Don Horton said they may have to do the sewer hook- up at the access point near her property, but will be using the proposed new entry point at the rear.

Ms. Allen explained she should speak with the Planning Department about building.

Ms. Eklom asked if the new house was going to be pink like the historic house so that it all looks the same.

Mr. Bender said no the new should not look like the old.

Mr. Bender said there are a lot of considerations.

Mr. Mercado said a Planner will be here at 2:00. They must consider lot size, coverage, and the historic overlay.

Richard Agler feels the proposed structure will overpower the historic house.

Board discussion

Mr. Bender said he does not discourage contemporary architecture. He likes the massing and building scale. He asked if there was a conservation easement on the property. The Architect has done a credible job of bringing the scale down by using small components with the varying rooflines, porches, separating the building out, and setting the building back.

Ms. Allen said she had a conservation easement on her two lots before she sold them to the county. She asked if they could break up the scale of the rear porches as a storm could remove the existing vegetation and the back might become

visible.

Mr. Strang said the louvers help break the scale up.

(Continued)

Mr. Agler asked that the Commission consider this carefully.

Mr. Bender said he brought up an interesting point. We need to consider the scale of the historic house. He would like to see the limits of the scarified property. He noted a berm may not be allowed in a high velocity zone.

Mr. Strang said he brought the scale down by using the berm , low sloped roofs, and by breaking the structure into two components.

Mr. Bender asked what if they do not allow the berm.

Mr. Strang said Dr. Paul Lind is preparing a hydrologist report.

Mr. Bender asked that they consider moving the house further back.

Mr. Strang responded it is about seeking balance.

Mr. Bender said this is a credible job. The scale is an issue and he is not prepared to make a motion without the hydrologist report.

Mr. Clupper said he feels it would be better to move the new house back and to reduce the size.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to table so these issues can be addressed. Jim Clupper seconded the motion.

4. SILVIA FULLER is proposing to relocate the existing propane tanks from the NE side of the building to the SE side, on an engineered concrete slab with tie downs, at the property located at 91885 Overseas Highway. The subject property is legally described as Tavernier #2 PB2-8 Key Largo Block D and Part of un-named 30 ft. Rd. Island of Key Largo PB1-T Lot 17, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00556180-000000.

Staff presentation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable guidelines and standards.

Applicant presentation

No one was present to represent the project.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

The Commission reviewed the file and felt the proposed propane tank re-location would be an improvement.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve. Jim Clupper seconded the motion. A roll call vote was taken and all were in favor of the motion.

5. MARK HEWITT is proposing to add four 16" square concrete posts faced with keystone, replace old front fence with new white 4' fence with 3/4" pickets, new swing in gate, new driveway with Old Chicago brick on sand, and new lush landscaping in the front yard at 159 Atlantic Circle. The subject property is legally described as Tavernier #2 PB2-8 Key Largo a portion of the SE'LY 3.5' of Lot 3 & S'LY 57' Lot 4 BK C, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00556140-000100.

Staff presentation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable guidelines and standards.

Applicant presentation

Linda (last name unknown), a representative from Design Source presented the project. She explained the house was built in 1998 and currently has white aluminum railings. The new aluminum fence will be more compatible with this.

Public testimony.

No public input.

Board discussion

Mr. Bender said he has no problem with the proposed fence. He explained the Old Chicago brick driveway would be out of character with Tavernier Historic District.

Ms. Allen and Mr. Clupper agreed.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve the proposed fence and to disapprove the brick driveway. The driveway, if desired, can be covered with gravel or shell. Jim Clupper seconded the motion. All voted in favor of the motion.

6. THE PIGEON KEY FOUNDATION

is requesting demolition approval for two existing pavilions. Support columns and roofs would be removed while the slab would remain in place. The subject property is physically located at 44800 Overseas Highway and is legally described as Pigeon Key Lot 1 G-6-46/55 OR15-374/376 OR1541—420/424 (Rest Cov) OR1604-541/45 (Rest/Cov) , Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00106120-000000-13-66-31.

Staff presentation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable guidelines and standards.

Applicant presentation

There was no one present when the application was considered.

Public testimony

No public input.

Board discussion

Mr. Bender said he has worked on Pigeon Key. The pavilion structures are not from the period of concern.

Mr. Clupper noted he does not object to this but wonders why they are not removing the slabs.

Motion

Jim Clupper motioned to approve the demolition. Bert Bender seconded the motion. All voted in favor.

(Later, Kelly McKinnon Executive Director of the Pigeon Key Foundation arrived. He explained they are leaving the slabs because of the expense of removal and disposal and that they can be used for picnic tables. He was advised that we need at least a week's notice of when construction work for the new solar array will commence as Archaeologists {Dr. Robert Carr} will be coming from Miami).

7. CYNTHIA MARTIN is proposing a revision to a previously approved roofline change at 207 Tarpon Street, Tavernier. The property is described as Lots 21-22, Tavernier Cove PB1-103, Tavernier, Monroe County, Florida. The real estate identification number is 00506080-000000.

Staff presentation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable guidelines and standards.

Letters from the public all in favor of the application were read into the

record from:

Stu and Kathleen Bautz
Jack Devawnby
The Charles Wakeman Family
Louis and Joan Gaines
Casey M. Jeffries
Miles Lieberman
Leslie Sharman
George and Rachel McElveen
Charles F. Sposato
Renee & Rodger Bennett
Nathan Weinbaum
Stephen Lohmayer

Applicant Presentation

Cynthia Martin presented the project. She met with Bert Bender and her architect, Brett. The house has been added onto three times which accounts for the roof's different levels. She started this work in 2009. There is a lot of rotted wood. She did not know she was in a historic neighborhood. Her engineer is Daryl Osborne. She loves her home and the neighborhood. This has been a nightmare with leaking plumbing and snakes in the house. There are structural problems. She pays more because the insurance company will not cover the house so she must use Lourdes of London.

Public testimony

Mindy Agler said she is in favor of this proposal.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said the existing roofline is charming. If insulation is desired you could use tapered roofing. The house should be contributing. Since it is not listed, we have to follow the guidelines for noncontributing structures.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve the proposed revisions. Jim Clupper seconded the motion. All three Commissioners present reluctantly voted in favor of the motion.

Other Business: The board agreed to schedule another workshop.

Adjournment.

As there was no other business, the meeting was adjourned.