

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission
MINUTES- Workshop and Regular Meeting
Monday, October 1, 2012 12:30 noon
Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Call to Order.

Alice Allen called the meeting to order.

Roll Call.

Alice Allen, Chair

Bert Bender

Jim Clupper

Donna Bosold, absent

Staff: Pedro Mercado, Assistant County Attorney

Rey Ortiz, Planner

Diane Silvia, Preservationist

12:30-2:00 Workshop on Design Guidelines

Alice Allen said she would like to see the cemetery on the Ballast Trail property recorded. She provided old aerial photographs of the area and photographs of the cemetery. One photo was taken by Commissioner Sylvia Murphy in 1954. The other photos were taken several years ago by Shirley Faye Albury. There are two concrete tombs. One of these has the year inscribed 1873. It is unknown if this is the birth or death date. Ms. Allen asked Shirley Faye to note the location of the cemetery on the current site plan for a proposed residence on the property.

Commissioner Sylvia Murphy arrived at the meeting with a signed affidavit attesting to her photo. She lived directly across the street from this cemetery in 1954. She cleared the heavily overgrown plot and took this photo. Commissioner Murphy agreed with Shirley Faye on the location of the cemetery on the site plan. She plans to take current photos of the site. Diane Silvia asked if she could go with her to record the plot.

Ms. Allen had a copy of the Planning Commission's Rules of Procedure and said we should adopt something similar.

Diane Silvia said we do have Rules of Procedure and that she would provide copies to the Commissioners for both the HPC and the Planning Commission for comparison and possible modification.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, October 1, 2012 12:30 noon

Tavernier Fire House

Page 2 of 6

Ms. Allen said one of her students is now the President of the History Club at Coral Shores High School. She would like to see the HPC get involved in this. We need to find out who their advisor is. We could invite them to an HPC meeting and provide references like book lists and web sites.

With respect to the Design Guidelines, Ms. Allen pointed out she does not want to shave any area off the existing Historic District. While Tavernier Street does not have any historic homes the surrounding streets do. You could have different language for that area. She asked Rey Ortiz for copies of the zoning maps.

Rey Ortiz explained he is under staffed and will provide them at the next meeting. He will bring the future land use map, the current zoning map, the permit and review process map and copies of the oldest and most recent aerial maps.

Bert Bender noted we need to make it so these concepts are understandable to people who are new to this. Actual illustrations are needed to explain concepts like scale, rhythm, and mass. Some of the illustrations in the Flagstaff publication would be useful. He will try to get some good examples.

The Commission discussed scheduling regular meetings the first Monday of each month at 2:00pm.

Jim Clupper had several publications from the National Trust, one on due process and the other on preservation law.

Diane Silvia said she will try to get copies of these.

2:00 pm Regular Meeting

Adoption of Minutes from the July 30, 2012.

Alice Allen had a correction on page 1 of the minutes to change "Founder's Park" to "Old Settler's Park." With that correction Bert Bender motioned to approve. Jim Clupper seconded the motion.

Ms. Allen noted during the workshop the Commission discussed recording the gravesites on the Ballast Trail property. The board also discussed holding regular meetings the first Monday of each month unless there were no applications. We will skip the December 3rd meeting due to the holidays. All of the Commission members were in favor of this.

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. ANDREW TOBIN is proposing to construct a new single family residence at 243 Tavernier Drive. The subject property is legally described as Block 8 Lot 7 Largo Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00477860-000000 (previously tabled at the March 5th, May 7th, and July 30th 2012 meetings).

Applicant presentation of new material

Andrew Tobin (property owner) and Larry Nix (designer) represented the project. They had a display that included elevation drawings and a rendering of the proposed building and examples of art deco elements on existing structures.

Mr. Tobin explained Larry Nix changed the recessed area to a pop out element. He noted they would like to add an eye-brow element on the NW elevation. He had a photo of an eye-brow element on a house in Miami as an example. He also had a drawing showing the addition of these elements.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said he did not see a problem with the eyebrow element.

Mr. Nix said he has followed the design principles of Miami architect, Al Parker that refer to cross ventilation and shade. The house will be 13' above grade. They are showing the colors as salmon and pink. The colors may be changed.

Rey Ortiz noted the plans submitted to Planning must be exactly the same as what the Commission approves. He cannot staff approve anything that is different.

Mr. Bender said if we approve this today it would be a conceptual approval. They should then come back with the construction documents for final approval.

Mr. Tobin said he is pleased that he does not have to duplicate historic structures. He has reviewed the guidelines again in relation to his project. The house must be on stilts and can be of stucco. He should not have to alter his setbacks as they will not be blocking anything. The intent is not to block the view of historic structures. This house will add to the ambiance of the neighborhood.

Mr. Nix said they are below the limits for height and setbacks.

Mr. Ortiz noted the reference to grade has changed. You might want to use crown of the road. Also keep in mind any architectural features will be counted in the setbacks as it is measured from the drip-line.

Ms. Silvia asked if they were going to go with the row of 5 windows on the drawings or use 4 as shown in the rendering of the northeast elevation.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, October 1, 2012 12:30 noon

Tavernier Fire House

Page 4 of 6

Mr. Nix said the row of 5.

Mr. Bender commended them for all of their research. The eyebrow adds character. He feels the design is appropriate for new construction in the Historic district. He also feels the colors are appropriate.

Mr. Clupper agreed with Bert and said in his opinion this will be a handsome house.

Ms. Allen agreed this design is an improvement.

Motion

Bert Bender moved to conceptually approve the project. Mr. Clupper seconded the motion. They should come back to the commission for final approval. In the meantime they can come back anytime for guidance.

Mr. Tobin thanked the Commission for their help.

Mr. Bender thanked Andy and Larry for their hard work and patience.

2. RAUL AND MARIA SANTAMARINA are proposing to replace an existing wood dock with a new concrete dock and to install a 15,000 lb elevator boat lift at 231 Tavernier Drive. The subject property is legally described as Lot 4 and adjacent bay bottom, Block 8, Largo Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Numbers: 00477830-000000.

Staff presentation & recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards.

Applicant presentation

Gay Marie Smith, agent for the owners, presented the project. She explained the new dock would be in the same footprint as the existing dock.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said he had no issues with the proposed project.

Jim Clupper and Alice Allen agreed, as long as the footprint remains the same.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve the project as proposed. Jim Clupper seconded the motion. All were in favor of the motion.

3. TAVERNIER PROPERTIES LLC is proposing to renovate an existing hotel room in the stand alone building located at 91865 Overseas Highway. The subject property is legally described as LT 1-5 and 36-37 BK A TAVERNIER NO. 2 PB2-8 Key Largo and PT Disclaimed Alley (Res NO.11-1968), Tavernier, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00555610-000000.

Staff presentation & recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Michael Murphy, All Tropical Construction, LLC, and Laurie Sprague, property manager, represented the project. He explained they are trying to make this building into an ADA hotel unit.

Laurie Sprague said she gets a lot of ADA requests and cannot accommodate them.

Mr. Murphy explained they were proposing single hung PGT windows. He has found a wood Anderson window with a clad exterior. He has been searching for a wood impact door with an ADA threshold but has been unable to locate one.

Bert Bender said they do make them.

Mr. Murphy said they would also like to change the existing concrete on the drive and parking area to pavers. He does not want to use stone or shell as it does not meet ADA standards.

Board discussion

Mr. Bender asked if they think the old windows are still there within the wall.

Ms. Sprague said there is tile over that area.

Mr. Bender said he has found that people are usually lazy and they may have simply covered them. If the original windows are present he would like to see them restored. He suggested using wood shutters over the existing doorway to retain the appearance of the original opening. He feels a side entry would be acceptable. The door would need to be ordered with an ADA threshold. The drawback is that it will not be water tight.

Jim Clupper agrees with Bert that the original windows should be restored. If they cannot be, they should be replicated.

Mr. Murphy thinks the original windows were plate glass. He could get those with mahogany frames.

Alice Allen asked about the pavers.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission
MINUTES
Monday, October 1, 2012 12:30 noon
Tavernier Fire House
Page 6 of 6

Mr. Bender recommended geo-grid with crushed granite. This is completely pervious.

Ms. Allen said pavers might not be appropriate.

The Commission agreed that pavers might be suitable to replace the concrete if they are the same color as the concrete.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to table this project so it can be modified to reflect the historic character of the building. Jim Clupper seconded the motion. All were in favor of the motion.

Mr. Ortiz suggested they speak with someone in the building department to discuss ADA requirements.

Other Business:

Mr. Ortiz asked the board for permission to speak with Diane about making the resolutions more firm.

The Commission agreed that is fine.

Mr. Ortiz said that as of today all drawings submitted to the County must be correct and proper.

Mr. Bender said that is a good idea and the HPC should have a stamp to show what was approved. 245 Tarpon

Mr. Ortiz said Monroe County will issue a building permit and then a separate Notice to Proceed when all agency requirements are completed. The FEMA injunction list has been replaced by a Permit Referral Process. He will supply a map showing the properties that would be affected.

Adjournment.

As there was no other business, Bert Bender motioned to adjourn. Jim Clupper seconded the motion.