

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday, December 3, 2012 2:00

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



Call to Order.

Alice Allen called the meeting to order.

Roll Call.

Alice Allen, Chair

Bert Bender

Donna Bosold

Ray Rash

Jim Clupper, absent

Staff: Steve Williams, County Attorney

Rey Ortiz, County Planner

Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of Minutes from the October 1, 2012 meeting.

Bert Bender motioned to approve the minutes from the October 1, 2012 meeting. Alice Allen seconded the motion.

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. TAVERNIER PROPERTIES LLC is proposing to renovate an existing hotel room in the stand alone building located at 91865 Overseas Highway. The subject property is legally described as LT 1-5 and 36-37 BK A TAVERNIER NO. 2 PB2-8 Key Largo and PT Disclaimed Alley (Res NO.11-1968), Tavernier, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00555610-000000. (Previously tabled at the October 1, 2012 meeting)

Applicant presentation of new material

Laurie Sprague, property manager, and Roland Fletch, representing the project contractor, All Tropical Construction, presented the project. They brought an example of the gray concrete paver they plan to use in the driveway. They also had a photo of the historic gas station. Alice Allen also presented a photo. They explained they will use the existing window frames and will replace the glass.

Public testimony

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, December 3, 2012 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 2 of 6

There was no public input.

Board discussion

Bert Bender noted that the door in the center of the front elevation has a horizontal member visible in the photo as part of the bracing. This is shown on the door interior. It may or may not have been present on the door exterior. It would look more authentic if they put this on the exterior as well. He pointed out that the windows on the historic building are square.

Laurie Sprague said the windows had been covered by tile on the exterior and drywall on the interior. They will modify the frames to fit the opening.

Mr. Fletch said they could add false shutters.

Mr. Bender said that is not necessary. They should follow the original window size. The roofing material should match.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve with the condition that the existing windows are refurbished and used in the existing openings, that the roofing material matches the existing, and that gray concrete pavers are used for the driveway. Donna Bosold seconded the motion.

Laurie Sprague asked if they could install a replica gas pump.

The commission members had no objection to this.

Rey Ortiz said they do not have to come back for this as long as a building permit is not required.

2. VNA HOSPICE OF THE FLORIDA KEYS is proposing to install a new ground sign at 92001 Overseas Highway. The subject property is legally described as Island of Key largo PB1-64 PT Lot 14, Tavernier, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00089670-000100.

Bert Bender disclosed that he did the drawings for this project pro bono.

Steve Williams explained there is no conflict if there was no financial gain.

Staff presentation & recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Bert Bender explained that Greg Wheeler planned to represent the project but was having car

trouble. He can help if there are any questions.

Public testimony

There was no public input.

Board discussion

Mr. Bender explained that this is a hand carved, painted wood sign with simple posts. It is low scale as not to disturb the view of the historic structure.

Donna Bosold said it is nicely done. She asked Rey Ortiz if the sign size follows the county ordinance.

Mr. Ortiz said it is 23 square feet and the ordinance allows for 75 square feet.

Motion

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the sign as proposed. Ray Rhash seconded the motion.

3. FREDRICK CRACK ABND WESLEY HARTMAN are proposing to construct a new single family residence at 125 Lowe Street. The subject property is legally described as Island of Key Largo PT Lot 10, Tavernier, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Numbers: 00090270-000300.

Staff presentation & recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines

Applicant presentation

Fredrick Crack, property owner, presented the project. He explained that he and his son Wesley Hartman would like to eventually build two identical, modest houses on the property. We are reviewing one of those houses today.

Public testimony

Richard Volland, father of homeowner Coral Volland at 122 Lowe Street, said they have been under the impression that this land could not be built on.

Staff response

Rey Ortiz explained it is zoned SR, Suburban Residential. There was a transfer of development rights and 1.6 allocated units have been approved for these two lots. They have approval only for one house at this time.

Applicant response

Mr. Crack said his planner Norman said he needed design review first. He knows there may be more planning issues.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, December 3, 2012 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 4 of 6

Steve Williams noted it is fine that this is an initial step, it is the chicken and the egg situation.

Mr. Ortiz said each house would have to be reviewed individually.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said he sees they are planning to remove invasive, exotic vegetation. He went by the property and noted there are many native trees. He has no issues with the scale of the house but is concerned about the siting with regard to the native trees. He went onto note he has no problem with two identical houses as far as design review goes, as this was commonly done historically.

Alice Allen thinks the property is Tier 3 and Tier 3a.

Susan Spront did the vegetation survey.

Ms. Allen asked for the survey date.

Mr. Crack said October 20, 2011.

Richard Volland asked, didn't Mr. Ortiz say only one house could be built.

Mr. Bender clarified, I said if he had permission. I would not object to two identical homes if it is determined he can legally build two homes. His concern is the vegetation.

Mr. Crack said he wants to minimize vegetation disturbance and wants to save significant trees.

Mr. Bender said he would like to have a survey showing all of the existing vegetation. He would like to see an overlay site plan that depicts all of the existing vegetation in relation to the proposed site plan.

Ms. Allen said the lush landscaping is a major identifying feature of Tavernier. She has fought hard to get this area even to a Tier 3. There are exotics here but also valuable trees.

Mr. Crack said his architect did site the house in relation to the vegetation.

Ms. Allen said she is concerned with the house placement.

Donna Bosold noted the floor plans note, read in reverse.

Mr. Bender said if this was his project he would remove the invasive exotics first and then survey the remaining vegetation.

Rey Ortiz said he has spoken with the County Biologist about this property and he feels it may

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, December 3, 2012 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 5 of 6

have to be reviewed by Fish and Wildlife. He must apply to the Building Department first in order to have a biological review.

Mr. Crack said he wants to minimize any impact as it can be quite costly. The proposed house size is adequate for his needs.

Mr. Ortiz pointed out that density does not have to do with size but with the number of units.

Mr. Bender said he does not see anything that goes against the guidelines as far as the architecture.

Mr. Crack said he would like to have impact windows.

Mr. Bender noted he does not object to whether or not they install shutters. His big concern is the vegetation.

Ms. Bosold asked Rey Ortiz if they currently have an allocation for one unit.

Mr. Ortiz answered yes.

Ms. Bosold said this is different, it is just a transfer of development rights.

Mr. Crack noted they have addressed the vegetation and sited the house accordingly.

Mr. Bender said he would like to see a vegetation overlay. He is concerned about the proposed location of the building.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to table so that an overlay of the vegetation survey can be done for the proposed site plan. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. All were in favor of the motion.

Other Business:

The Commission was provided with copies of the HPC rules and procedures and of the Planning Board rules and procedures for their review. If there are any proposed changes they will need to go to the Board of County Commissioners for approval.

Alice Allen explained that one of the graves had been removed from the cemetery on Ballast Trail. She asked if the site was registered.

Diane Silvia said yes.

Ms. Allen has been researching the cemetery and found the existing stone is that for Edward Morris Williams who died in the 1935 hurricane. He was 35 years old when he died. He was the

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday, December 3, 2012 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 6 of 6

son of the captain that brought the supplies from Key West. Edward Morris Williams and his wife were on Windley Key. The oral history is that he got out of the car and was struck by a board or branch. He was able to get back to the car but died. According to his daughter his remains were dis-interred and relocated. The grave where the stone is missing was for Annie Laurie Lowe, Amos Lowe's daughter. She was born in 1873 and died in 1897. She is probably still buried here. This is a very significant historic site for Tavernier. The Plantation Key burials were washed away in the hurricane and there are no other cemeteries in this area.

Mr. Bender noted ground penetrating radar could be used to determine if there are burials present.

Ms. Allen pointed out there are living relatives, Shirley Faye Albury is a first cousin. One of her students has approached her that is in the high school History Club and Shirley Faye is willing to talk to them.

Rey Ortiz noted that the next ROGO cut-off date was January 12th.

The Commission agreed to hold a meeting on January 7th so that Mr. Crack could come back for the review of his vegetation overlay.

Adjournment.

Bert Bender motioned to adjourn. Donna Bosold seconded the motion.