

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday, March 4, 2013 2:00

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



Call to Order.

Alice Allen called the meeting to order.

Roll Call.

Alice Allen, Chair

Bert Bender

Ray Rash

Donna Bosold, absent

Jim Clupper, absent

Staff: Steve Williams, County Attorney

Rey Ortiz, County Planner

Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of Minutes from the February 4, 2012 meeting.

Bert Bender motioned to approve the minutes of the February 4, 2012 meeting. Ray Rhash seconded the motion.

2:00 pm Regular Meeting

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. HEINZ AND OURANIA HUBER are proposing to enclose the back porch with privacy fencing, change existing full bathroom to one and a half baths, erect privacy fencing between their driveway and the neighbor's driveway, erect privacy fencing on Beach Street side of property, erect privacy fencing between their property and 191 Lowe Street rear property, and paint their home at 185 Lowe Street pastel green with white trim. The subject property is legally described as Block 4 Lot 2 Tavernier Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00566340-000000.

Staff presentation & recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Jennifer Smith represented the property owners as they were out of town. David Dehaas is the

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

AGENDA

Monday, March 4, 2013 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 2 of 6

designer for the neighboring property and volunteered to help with any questions. He explained the owners have done a lot of planting.

Bert Bender said the fencing on the porch will probably not be visible from the street.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Mr. Bender asked to see the color chip for the proposed exterior paint. The board agreed that a pastel was acceptable.

Alice Allen said she was concerned with the privacy fencing. It does not appear very neighborly. Most of us use vegetation for that purpose.

Motion

Alice Allen motioned to approve with the suggestion that they think about using shrubbery in the more public area, visible from the street. Bert Bender seconded the motion.

2. ANDREW TOBIN is proposing to construct a new single family residence at 243 Tavernier Drive. The subject property is legally described as Block 8 Lot 7 Largo Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00477860-000000.
(heard at the end of the meeting)

Staff presentation & recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Andrew Tobin, property owner, presented the project. He asked Ray Rhash if he had seen the previously approved plan. Mr. Rhash was given a set from the old file for his review. Mr. Tobin explained he paid \$300,000 for the lot and submitted plans for a modular home for ROGO. He noted there are no historic homes in Largo Beach. The house next door to him is basically a tear down. The previously approved house is concrete. He has priced this out and it is too expensive. The revised design is smaller, but similar.

Public testimony

There was no public comment.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said this new proposal is quite different.

Mr. Tobin said it is 500-600 square feet smaller

Mr. Bender said the fenestration was better on the previous design. You have also eliminated the cantilevered element. This new plan is squared off. The other design had solids and voids which made it interesting. You have eliminated the special features. He sees no issue with reducing the size.

Mr. Tobin explained construction costs are so high he cannot afford to build it. He finds square windows and railings attractive.

Mr. Bender said the pattern of the fenestration has changed.

Mr. Tobin also feels this plan is not as good. He showed a photo of a Miami house on his phone.

Mr. Bender sketched this design over the existing elevation. Explained this has got three dimensional elements. Your revised plan is flat, only two dimensional. Your previously approved plan was much better.

Mr. Tobin said he would come back.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to table so the plans can be rethought. Ray Rhash seconded the motion. All voted in favor of the motion.

3. HAROLD McMAHON is proposing to revise a previously approved application (July 30, 2012) to add a 2 story deck on the water side of the structure, a 3' X 3' addition and a new roof on the master bedroom, and replacement of windows on the street side of the home, at the property located at 198 Lowe Street. The revision is to eliminate the 3' x 3' addition to the bedroom, but still install the new impact windows, to enclose the existing porch which had previously been approved for a new concrete roof and add stairs for access. The subject property is legally described as BK 3 AMD Plat of Tavernier Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00566320-000000.

Staff presentation & recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

David Dehaas presented the project. He explained this is a revision to the previous approval.

They are leaving the master bedroom as existing. The revision is to enclose the porch so that the

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

AGENDA

Monday, March 4, 2013 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 4 of 6

living room will be larger with a view of the water. He came with a new plan that depicts a sloped roof.

The Commission explained they do not like to accept new material at a meeting as they do not have time to review it.

Steve Williams explained the policies and procedures allow the Commission to vote on a case by case basis on accepting new material here at the meeting.

Bert Bender motioned to allow this presentation of new material. Ray Rhash seconded the motion. A roll call vote was held. Bert Bender and Ray Rhash voted in favor of the motion. Alice Allen voted no. Therefore, the motion carried.

David Dehaas promised he would never do this again. He noted that this revision to the roofline was made was due to discoveries made during demolition.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Ray Rhash asked about the roofing materials.

Mr. Dehaas said it will be metal.

Mr. Bender asked if there was going to be a structural engineer working on this.

Mr. Dehaas said yes, Mr. Osborne.

Ms. Allen said it is very difficult to evaluate late entries.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve the proposed project with the new submittals, the revisions of A7 and A8 dated 1/23/13, revised 2/28/13. Ray Rhash seconded the motion. All voted in favor of the motion.

4. ROBERT HARTSING is proposing to tear off existing roofing and install peel and stick and modified bitumen to flat roof (like for like) and replace asphalt shingle roof with 5-vcrimp metal on the building located at 91551 Overseas Highway. The subject property is legally described as Lot 4 Tavernier Beach, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having Real Estate Number: 00566000-000000.

Staff presentation & recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Robert Hartsing had nothing to add.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

The Commission had no questions.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve the proposed project. Ray Rhash seconded the motion. All voted in favor of the motion.

5. CYNTHIA MARTIN is proposing a revision to the previously approved project at 207 Tarpon Street, Tavernier. The property is described as Lots 21-22, Tavernier CovePB1-103, Tavernier, Monroe County, Florida. The real estate identification number is 00506080-000000.

Staff presentation & recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report into the record noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Cynthia Martin, property owner, explained she was hoping to do this renovation step by step. It has taken a while to get this done. She is here for a revision, to enclose the previously approved side porch.

Public testimony

There was no public input.

Board discussion

The Commission had no comment.

Motion

Ray Rhash motioned to approve the revision. Bert Bender seconded the motion. All voted in favor of the motion.

Other Business:

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

AGENDA

Monday, March 4, 2013 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Page 6 of 6

Alice Allen said she revised the Tavernier historic marker text and has had it reviewed by Shirley Faye, Joanne Mackenzie, and Sylvia Murphy. It has been approved at the state level.

Bert Bender asked about what we should do about same day presentation of revisions.

Steve Williams said you can decide on a case by case basis by taking a vote.

Rey Ortiz said you could approve something that might have to be turned down due to planning rules.

Mr. Bender said we could have a hard and fast rule. In the case today, David's revision was better, so you are shooting yourself in the foot by not accepting the new material and keeping what he had.

Ms. Allen said she cannot digest this material quickly like Bert.

Cynthia Martin said she sees why there are revisions, as the work proceeds the scope keeps expanding.

Alice Allen noted that Richard Agler sold his home. The new lady of the house is an archaeologist. Also, Jerry Wilkinson has a new book out on Key Largo.

Adjournment.

As there was no other business, Bert Bender motioned to adjourn. Ray Rhash seconded the motion.