

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday October 3, 2016 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Present and answering to roll call were Chair-Commissioner Alice Allen, Commissioner Bert Bender, Commissioner Donna Bosold, Commissioner Kate DeLoach, and Commissioner Anne-Marie Victor-Howe

Staff present: Barbara Bauman, County Planner
Steve Williams, Assistant County Attorney
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of Minutes from the September 6, 2016 meeting.

Donna Bosold motioned to approve the minutes of the September 6, 2016 meeting. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Changes to the Agenda.

There were no changes to the agenda.

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. **David Boerner** is proposing to replace the wood framed windows with aluminum impact windows at his house at 124 Tavern Drive. The subject property is legally described as part of Lot 31, Block A, Tavernier 2, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 2 at Page 8 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida. and being more particularly described as follows: Beginning at the SE corner of Lot 31 and running 10 feet in a Southwesterly direction, thence 75 feet in a Northwesterly direction, thence 10 feet in a Northeasterly direction, thence 75 feet in a Southeasterly direction to the Point of Beginning. Also all of Lot 32, Block A, TAVERNIER 2, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 2 at Page 8 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida. Together with the southerly 5.00 feet of a 100 foot alley vacated in Official Record Book 405 at Page 1100, having Real Estate Number: 00555880-000000 (continued from the August 1, 2016, meeting).

Applicant presentation of additional information

David Boerner said at the last meeting he did not know the house was historic and did not have the staff report. He explained Bert Bender came to the house and looked at the windows and said they were fine and could be repaired. Mr. Boerner said they are not fine. He did look into the JELD-WEN windows. Windows must be designed for impact and wind pressure at 60lb per square foot to deal with negative and positive pressure to prevent them from blowing out. Once the windows blow out the pressure will cause the roof to blow off.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission

MINUTES

Monday October 3, 2016 2:00 pm

Tavernier Fire House

Mr. Boerner said his windows are noncompliant impact windows are safer and lower cost and can bring an insurance discount of 10-15%. To repair the windows is estimated at \$500 each. To replace each window with a JELD-WEN window is between \$1,100 and \$1,400. A regular impact window is about \$400 a window. He has found a vinyl impact window that looks like wood which would be safe and code compliant. Even if repaired the existing 1932 windows will not be code compliant. The sashes do not meet so they cannot be locked.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said under Chapter 12 of the Existing Building Code the Secretary of the Interior's Standards state you should repair or replace in-kind. Your building is contributing and the windows are repairable. He asked Mr. Boerner if he had consulted Jodi Rubin.

Mr. Boerner said he spoke with her but she has been able to come down. He had a window glazer look at the windows and he said that much of the wood is soft.

Mr. Bender said you can get the same insurance discount with the use of shutters to protect for impact.

Mr. Boerner said shutters do not deal with wind pressures. He can use an impact window which is safe and cost less. He is concerned about spending more than 50% of the value of the structure to make his work a substantial improvement.

Donna Bosold asked Steve Williams if the owner could divide the work into two different years to avoid substantial improvement.

Steve Williams said no.

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said she could consider approving the vinyl windows because they look the same.

Mr. Boerner said he is trying to fix up the house and make it safe. He is keeping the existing Bahama shutters so the windows will not even be visible.

Mr. Bender read the recommended and not recommended treatments for windows from Appendix B of the Existing Building Code.

Mr. Boerner said it says recommended not required.

Mr. Bender said this is not a court of law.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission
MINUTES
Monday October 3, 2016 2:00 pm
Tavernier Fire House

Mr. Boerner said yes it is.

Mr. Bender said the windows can be repaired.

Mr. Boerner said one of the sash is missing. Yes they can be rebuilt, but at what cost.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to deny the window replacement. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

2. Valerie Bell is proposing to remove an existing structure and spa in the backyard and install an in-ground pool, spa, and pool equipment at 157 Lowe Street. The subject property is legally described as: A parcel of land in Tavernier, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being hereinafter referred to as Parcel B 10, said parcel B 10 being a portion of Lot 10 of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD", consisting of Lots 3 and 4 and the West half of the Northwest Quarter in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East on Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1, at Page 80 of the Public Records on Monroe County, Florida, said PARCEL B 10 being more particularly described as follows:

Commencing at the Southwest Corner of Lot 9, Sunny Haven, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 1 at Page 185 of the said Public Records, run N 86° 22' 09" W along the Northerly side of a 15.00 feet wide street according to deed description recorded in Deed Book G-13 at Page 137 of the said Public Records for 95.00 feet to the Point of Beginning of the hereindescribed PARCEL B 10. From the said Point of Beginning continue N 86° 22' 09" W along the previously mentioned course for 42.86 feet; thence run N 47° 30' 35" W along the Northeasterly side of Lowe Street and along the Southwesterly side of the said Lot 10, of "PLAT OF THE AMOS LOWE HOMESTEAD" for 72.41 feet; thence run N 42° 29' 25" E for 100.00 feet; thence run S 47° 30' 35" E along a line parallel with the said Northwesterly side of Lowe Street for 37.14 feet; thence run S 86° 22' 09" E along a line parallel with the Northerly side of the aforementioned 15.00 feet wide street for 7.59 feet; thence run S 3° 37' 51" W for 100.00 feet to the Point of Beginning of the hereindescribed PARCEL B 10, containing 8000 square feet.

Bearings hereinmentioned are description bearings contained in deed description recorded in Monroe County, Florida Official Records Book 922 at Pages 907 and 908.

Description is a new description written based on field survey and instruments of records, (Plat Book 1, Page 80, Plat Book 1, Page 185, Deed Book G-13, Page 137, and Official Records Book 922, Page 907 and 908), having Real Estate Number: 0009020270-000000

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission
MINUTES
Monday October 3, 2016 2:00 pm
Tavernier Fire House

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Krissy Lynn, agent for the applicant, presented the project. The applicant's husband William Jones was also present. Ms. Lynn brought samples of the proposed pool tile and coping. She explained they still have not decided about the pool deck so they will have to come back to the HPC with that.

Public testimony

There was not public testimony.

Board discussion

Bert Bender feels the proposed project complies with the guidelines.

Alice Allen reviewed a photo of the small building to be demolished.

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe said it does not look like it is in very good condition.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve. Anne-Marie Victor-Howe seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

3. **Monroe County Board of County Commissioners** is proposing to remove and replace the roofing on the Section Gang Quarters building at Pigeon Key with new modified bitumen rolled roofing over 5/8" sheathing, re-secure the window overhangs as required, replace rotted roof sheathing and asphalt shingles on the overhangs and rotted fascia, and siding, as per approved plans. The subject property is physically located at 44800 Overseas Highway and is legally described as All of Pigeon Key, an island approximately 5.31 acres located at Mile Marker 45, along the Old Seven Mile Bridge, Lot 1, Section 13, Township 66 South, Range 31 East, Tallahassee Meridian, and deeded to the Overseas Road and Toll Bridge District from the Florida East Coast Railway Company by Deed dated November 9, 1936, and recorded in Deed Record G-6, pages 46 to 55, and thereafter deeded to Monroe County by Warranty Deed, recorded at OR-15, pages 374 to 376, having Real Estate Number: 00106120-000000.

Bert Bender recused himself as he is the architect for the applicant.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission
MINUTES
Monday October 3, 2016 2:00 pm
Tavernier Fire House

Applicant presentation

Bert Bender, architect for the applicant represented the project. He explained that in the past he had done an architectural study of all the structures on Pigeon Key. The period of concern was from the time of construction up to 1939-40. The original roof on the Section Gang Quarter building was a material known as Flint Coat. This material is no longer made as it contained asbestos so the manufacturer went out of business in the 1970's. The product they are proposing here is almost identical to Flint Coat. The asphalt shingles they are proposing for the window overhangs will be identical to the existing ones.

Public testimony

There was no public comment.

Board discussion

Donna Bosold noted this was approved by the State before it came to us.

Bert Bender said he sends applications like this to the State and also to the local jurisdiction.

Motion

Anne-Marie Victor-Howe motioned to approve. Donna Bosold seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Other Business:

Diane Silvia gave the HPC copies of the final survey update report and explained it will go in front of the BOCC at their October 19, 2016 meeting.

Donna Bosold suggested that the mile marker number be added to the address of the newly recorded Key Largo properties with Fish names as there are streets with duplicate Fish names which can create confusion.

Adjournment.

Bert Bender motioned to adjourn. Kate DeLoach seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

ADA ASSISTANCE: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, please contact the County Administrator's Office, by phoning (305) 292-4441, between the hours of 8:30 a.m. - 5:00 p.m., no later than five (5) calendar days prior to the scheduled meeting; if you are hearing or voice impaired, call "711".