

HPC

**Historic Preservation Commission
Monroe County
Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness
July 9, 2018**

Staff Report

197 Lowe Street

Harold McMahon (File 2018-093) is proposing to remove and replace existing swimming pool, deck, and security fencing and add stairs, an elevated deck and roof structure over a portion of the deck at 197 Lowe Street within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00566370-000000.

The CBS structure located at 197 Lowe Street was built in 1983 according to the Property Appraiser's records and is considered a noncontributing residential structure.

From the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards* (p.9)

Standard 9: "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."

Standard 10: "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

Analysis:

The elevation of the pool and deck should be discussed.

Diane E. Silvia, Historic Florida Keys Foundation

HPC

**Historic Preservation Commission
Monroe County
Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness
July 9, 2018**

Staff Report

231 Tavernier Drive

Description of the Proposal

Raul and Maria Santamarina (File No. 2018-094) are proposing to install an elevator and remove and replace the stairway and rear deck with concrete at 231 Tavernier Drive within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00477830-000000.

Property description

This is an elevated 2 story frame structure built in 1986.

Relevant Standards and Guidelines: From the Tavernier Historic District Preservation Guidelines:

From the Secretary of the Interior's Standards (p.9)

Standard 9: "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."

Standard 10: "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

Discussion

The structure located at 231 Tavernier Drive is noncontributing. The applicant is proposing to add an elevator on the east side of the structure. It is being requested for medical reasons. They also plan to remove and replace the existing stairway and rear deck in concrete. The project should have no negative effect on the character of the district.

Diane E. Silvia, Historic Florida Keys Foundation

HPC

**Historic Preservation Commission
Monroe County
Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness
July 9, 2018**

Staff Report

144 Sunrise Drive

Description of the Proposal

Jocelyn Tiedeman (File No. 2018-114) is proposing to construct a new single family residence with a gravel driveway at 144 Sunrise Drive within the Tavernier Historic District, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00-00506320-000000 and legally described as:

Lot 39, TAVERNIER COVE, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 103 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

Project History

The property is currently a vacant residential lot.

Relevant Standards and Guidelines for New Homes: From the Tavernier Historic District Preservation Guidelines:

Site Development: (p.18-19) “New buildings have to comply with the ordinance and will be individually reviewed to ensure that their placement does not dominate or obscure historic structures.”

Driveways: (p. 20) “Driveways are not a requirement in the historic district; however, should a driveway be needed, it should be finished with crushed shell, gravel, or other pervious surface.”

Height: (p. 20) “New buildings will be reviewed to ensure that the height is appropriate and does not obscure or adversely impact the historic scale of the historic district.”

Building Base Height: (p. 22) “New Buildings: The building base height will be reviewed within the context of surrounding structures. If a new building is adjacent to a contributing structure the new building should be constructed at the minimum flood level. In the case of single-family residences, the first habitable floor should be at the minimum elevation required by FEMA requirements. When a new building’s base height is

proposed above the historic base height, the space below the first habitable floor should be detailed so the base of the building extends to the plane of the railings or walls above.

Roof Shape: (p. 23) “New residential buildings should have sloped roofs.”

Roofing: (p. 24) “New buildings should use the same materials listed above.” [“standing seam metal, V-crimp, stamped metal and composition tile.”]

Porches: (p.23) “Porches should be compatible with the architecture of the historic district.

Exterior Walls: (p. 24) “New Buildings: Novelty siding, clapboard and board-and-batten are the recommended exterior wall materials; stucco and fiber cement siding maybe acceptable but will be reviewed on an individual basis.”

Doors (p. 25) “New Buildings: Doors should be compatible with the character of the district.”

Windows (p. 26) “New Buildings: Windows should be compatible with the character of the district.”

Landscaping and Natural Environment (p. 28) The intent of this provision is to maintain the neighborhood tree cover and shade to maintain Tavernier as a distinctive community.

New Building Types (p. 30) The intent is to guide the development of new construction so that buildings are compatible with the character of the district in massing, scale and materials.

From the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards* (p.9)

Standard 9: “New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.”

Analysis

This proposal seeks to construct a new residence on one of the most historically significant streets in the Tavernier Historic District. This two-story design has an overall height just below 35’ and may over shadow the small-scale character of its historic neighbors.