Basis for Enforcement of Substantial Damage/Substantial Improvement for Local Governments

Under the NFIP

- FEMA, through the NFIP, provides subsidized flood insurance to property owners in states/communities that agree to adopt and enforce minimum land use and permitting standards, as well as adequate enforcement provisions, designed to minimize the risk of flood damage to structures in areas of special flood hazard.
  - 44 CFR Subpart A §59.2 Description of program (b)
- In 44 CFR 60.3 (c) ii and (e), FEMA identifies the minimum regulatory standards that communities must adopt and enforce to remain eligible for the program and for their property owners to obtain NFIP-backed insurance. Though the section is cumulative, (c) and (e) are provide the most specific guidance regarding the County’s hazard data,
- These regulations providing definitions for the subpart (44 CFR Part 59.1)iiidefine substantial damage1 and substantial improvement as follows:
  - Substantial Damage – means damage of any origin sustained by a structure whereby the cost of restoring the structure to its before damaged condition would equal or exceed 50 percent of the market value of the structure before the damage occurred
  - Substantial Improvement – Substantial improvement means any reconstruction, rehabilitation, addition, or other improvement of a structure, the cost of which equals or exceeds 50 percent of the market value of the structure before the “start of construction” of the improvement. This term includes structures that have incurred “substantial damage”, regardless of the actual repair work performed. The term does not, however, include either:
    - (1) Any project for improvement of a structure to correct existing violations of state or local health, sanitary, or safety code specifications which have been identified by the local code enforcement official and which are the minimum necessary to assure safe living conditions or
    - (2) Any alteration of a “historic structure”, provided that the alteration will not preclude the structure’s continued designation as a “historic structure.”
- These same regulations also require that any new construction or substantial improvement(s) must meet various building performance standards including requiring the elevation of the lowest floor above the Base Flood Information, as provides for flood-proofing for non-residential structures where feasible. See 44 CFR Part 60.3(a)-(e).
- As required by the federal regulation, Monroe County has adopted (and amended multiple times) Chapter 122 Floodplain Management in its Code of Ordinances. Specifically relevant to the issue of substantial damage and substantial improvement:
  - “The BOCC deem it in the best interest of its citizens that prudent measures be taken to minimize the potential public and private loss due to flooding. It is the intent of the BOCC that the county at all times be eligible for, and receive, the benefit of participation in the National Flood Insurance Program. It is therefore the intent of the BOCC that the provisions of this chapter be strictly adhered to in all areas of special flood hazard within the jurisdiction of the unincorporated areas of the county”
  - [Sec 122-1(b) “Purpose and Intent”]
  - “Substantial damage means damage of any origin sustained by a structure whereby the cost of restoring the structure to it’s before damaged condition would equal or exceed 50 percent of the market value of the structure before the damage occurred. All structures that are

---

1 Please note the federal regulatory definition of “substantial improvement” includes those structures that have “incurred” substantial damage, regardless of whether or not the full scope of required construction work occurs.
determined to be substantially damaged are automatically considered to be substantial improvements, regardless of the actual repair work performed. If the cost necessary to fully repair the structure to its before damage condition is equal to or greater than 50 percent of the structure’s market value before damages, then the structure must be elevated (or flood proofed if it is non-residential) to or above the base flood elevation (BFE), and meet other applicable NFIP requirements. Items that may be excluded from the cost to repair include plans, specifications, survey costs, permit fees, and other items which are separate from the repair. Items that may also be excluded include demolition or emergency repairs (costs to temporarily stabilize a building so that it’s safe to enter to evaluate and identify required repairs) and improvements to items outside the building, such as the driveway, septic systems, wells, fencing, landscaping and detached structures.”

- [Sec 122-3(a) “Permit Requirements”]
- Substantial improvement means any reconstruction, rehabilitation, addition, or other improvement of a structure, the cost of which equals or exceeds 50 percent of the market value of the structure before the "start of construction" of the improvement. This term includes structures which have incurred "substantial damage, "regardless of the actual repair work performed. [exceptions omitted]
- [Sec 122-3(a) “Permit Requirements”]
- “In all areas of special flood hazard where base flood elevation data has been provided the following provisions are required: (1) Residential construction. a. New construction and substantial improvement of any residential structure shall have the lowest floor for zones A1-30, AE and AH or bottom of the lowest supporting member of the lowest floor for zones V1-30, VE or V elevated at or above the base flood elevation level.”
- [Sec 122-4(b) “Standards for Issuance of Building Permits in Areas of Special Flood Hazard”]

- FEMA’s NFIP regulations require that participating municipalities adopt and adhere to regulations that impose the minimum performance and administrative standards. Buildings deemed to be substantially damaged are, by effect of the regulations, automatically deemed to be substantial improvements. The same Federal regulations specify that work constituting substantial improvement in the Special Flood Hazard Area (“SFHA”) must be brought into compliance with multiple performance standards. As required, the Monroe County BOCC has adopted Chapter 122 to enforce the minimum standards allowing for participation in the NFIP. The BOCC’s language largely tracks that of FEMA’s minimum standards, adopts these definitions and performance standards, requiring that the County adhere to and enforce them. The BOCC has unequivocally stated that the floodplain management requirements are to be strictly adhered to.

- Following known, widespread damage events (regardless of cause), special attention will be paid as to how the County enforced the substantial improvement and performance standards where substantial damage, and therefore substantial improvements, are likely to have occurred. Especially where there is an emergency permit phase, or where certain types and amounts of work are exempt for a period of time following an emergency/damage event, the failure of the County to take reasonable steps to enforce Chapter 122 could be seen as a failure to enforce the required minimum NFIP standards. This

---

2 It is therefore the intent of the BOCC that the provisions of this chapter be strictly adhered to in all areas of special flood hazard within the jurisdiction of the unincorporated areas of the county.
would likely jeopardize the County’s participation in the NFIP, end the current insurance discounts achieved through the Community Rating System3 ("CRS") Program, and suspend the ability of most of its residents and businesses to obtain flood insurance for their properties.

---

3 The CRS program requires, within the initial “Class” of participation, that “[T]he community must be in full compliance with the minimum requirements of the NFIP. There must be correspondence from the Regional Office of the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) stating that the community is in full compliance with the NFIP. […] If a community is determined at any time to be in less-than full compliance, it will retrograde to a CRS Class 10.” The CRS is cumulative in that all requirements imposed upon a lower Class remain in force as a participant climbs in Class.

---

1 44 CFR 59.2 [Description of Program] “To qualify for the sale of federally-subsidized flood insurance a community must adopt and submit to the Federal Insurance Administrator, as part of its application, flood plain management regulations, satisfying at a minimum the criteria set forth at part 60 of this subchapter, designed to reduce or avoid future flood, mudslide (i.e., mudflow) or flood-related erosion damages. These regulations must include effective enforcement provisions.”

2 44 CFR 60.3 (a)-(e) [Floodplain Management Criteria for Flood-Prone Areas] “The Federal Insurance Administrator will provide the data upon which flood plain management regulations shall be based. If the Federal Insurance Administrator has not provided sufficient data to furnish a basis for these regulations in a particular community, the community shall obtain, review and reasonably utilize data available from other Federal, State or other sources pending receipt of data from the Federal Insurance Administrator. However, when special flood hazard area designations and water surface elevations have been furnished by the Federal Insurance Administrator, they shall apply. The symbols defining such special flood hazard designations are set forth in §64.3 of this subchapter. In all cases the minimum requirements governing the adequacy of the flood plain management regulations for flood-prone areas adopted by a particular community depend on the amount of technical data formally provided to the community by the Federal Insurance Administrator. Minimum standards for communities are as follows:

(a) When the Federal Insurance Administrator has not defined the special flood hazard areas within a community, has not provided water surface elevation data, and has not provided sufficient data to identify the floodway or coastal high hazard area, but the community has indicated the presence of such hazards by submitting an application to participate in the Program, the community shall:

(1) Require permits for all proposed construction or other development in the community, including the placement of manufactured homes, so that it may determine whether such construction or other development is proposed within flood-prone areas;

(2) Review proposed development to assure that all necessary permits have been received from those governmental agencies from which approval is required by Federal or State law, including section 404 of the Federal Water Pollution Control Act Amendments of 1972, 33 U.S.C. 1334;

(3) Review all permit applications to determine whether proposed building sites will be reasonably safe from flooding. If a proposed building site is in a flood-prone area, all new construction and substantial improvements shall (i) be designed (or modified) and adequately anchored to prevent flotation, collapse, or lateral movement of the structure resulting from hydrodynamic and hydrostatic loads, including the effects of buoyancy, (ii) be constructed with materials resistant to flood damage, (iii) be constructed by methods and practices that minimize flood damages, and (iv) be constructed with electrical, heating, ventilation, plumbing, and air conditioning equipment and other service facilities that are designed and/or located so as to prevent water from entering or accumulating within the components during conditions of flooding.

(4) Review subdivision proposals and other proposed new development, including manufactured home parks or subdivisions, to determine whether such proposals will be reasonably safe from flooding. If a subdivision proposal or other proposed new development is in a flood-prone area, any such proposals shall be reviewed to assure that (i) all such proposals are consistent with the need to minimize flood damage within the flood-prone area, (ii) all public utilities and facilities, such as sewer, gas, electrical, and water systems are located and constructed to minimize or eliminate flood damage, and (iii) adequate drainage is provided to reduce exposure to flood hazards;
(5) Require within flood-prone areas new and replacement water supply systems to be designed to minimize or eliminate infiltration of flood waters into the systems; and

(6) Require within flood-prone areas (i) new and replacement sanitary sewage systems to be designed to minimize or eliminate infiltration of flood waters into the systems and discharges from the systems into flood waters and (ii) onsite waste disposal systems to be located to avoid impairment to them or contamination from them during flooding.

(b) When the Federal Insurance Administrator has designated areas of special flood hazards (A zones) by the publication of a community’s FHBM or FIRM, but has neither produced water surface elevation data nor identified a floodway or coastal high hazard area, the community shall:

(1) Require permits for all proposed construction and other developments including the placement of manufactured homes, within Zone A on the community’s FHBM or FIRM;

(2) Require the application of the standards in paragraphs (a) (2), (3), (4), (5) and (6) of this section to development within Zone A on the community’s FHBM or FIRM;

(3) Require that all new subdivision proposals and other proposed developments (including proposals for manufactured home parks and subdivisions) greater than 50 lots or 5 acres, whichever is the lesser, include within such proposals base flood elevation data;

(4) Obtain, review and reasonably utilize any base flood elevation and floodway data available from a Federal, State, or other source, including data developed pursuant to paragraph (b)(3) of this section, as criteria for requiring that new construction, substantial improvements, or other development in Zone A on the community’s FHBM or FIRM meet the standards in paragraphs (c)(2), (c)(3), (c)(5), (c)(6), (c)(12), (c)(14), (d)(2) and (d)(3) of this section;

(5) Where base flood elevation data are utilized, within Zone A on the community’s FHBM or FIRM:

(i) Obtain the elevation (in relation to mean sea level) of the lowest floor (including basement) of all new and substantially improved structures, and

(ii) Obtain, if the structure has been flood-proofed in accordance with paragraph (c)(3)(ii) of this section, the elevation (in relation to mean sea level) to which the structure was flood-proofed, and

(iii) Maintain a record of all such information with the official designated by the community under §59.22 (a)(9)(iii);

(6) Notify, in riverine situations, adjacent communities and the State Coordinating Office prior to any alteration or relocation of a watercourse, and submit copies of such notifications to the Federal Insurance Administrator;

(7) Assure that the flood carrying capacity within the altered or relocated portion of any watercourse is maintained;

(8) Require that all manufactured homes to be placed within Zone A on a community’s FHBM or FIRM shall be installed using methods and practices which minimize flood damage. For the purposes of this requirement, manufactured homes must be elevated and anchored to resist flotation, collapse, or lateral movement. Methods of anchoring may include, but are not to be limited to, use of over-the-top or frame ties to ground anchors. This requirement is in addition to applicable State and local anchoring requirements for resisting wind forces.

(c) When the Federal Insurance Administrator has provided a notice of final flood elevations for one or more special flood hazard areas on the community’s FIRM and, if appropriate, has designated other special flood hazard areas without base flood elevations on the community’s FIRM, but has not identified a regulatory floodway or coastal high hazard area, the community shall:

(1) Require the standards of paragraph (b) of this section within all A1-30 zones, AE zones, A zones, AH zones, and AO zones, on the community’s FIRM;
(2) Require that all new construction and substantial improvements of residential structures within Zones A1-30, AE and AH zones on the community’s FIRM have the lowest floor (including basement) elevated to or above the base flood level, unless the community is granted an exception by the Federal Insurance Administrator for the allowance of basements in accordance with §60.6 (b) or (c);

(3) Require that all new construction and substantial improvements of non-residential structures within Zones A1-30, AE and AH zones on the community’s firm (i) have the lowest floor (including basement) elevated to or above the base flood level or, (ii) together with attendant utility and sanitary facilities, be designed so that below the base flood level the structure is watertight with walls substantially impermeable to the passage of water and with structural components having the capability of resisting hydrostatic and hydrodynamic loads and effects of buoyancy;

(4) Provide that where a non-residential structure is intended to be made watertight below the base flood level, (i) a registered professional engineer or architect shall develop and/or review structural design, specifications, and plans for the construction, and shall certify that the design and methods of construction are in accordance with accepted standards of practice for meeting the applicable provisions of paragraph (c)(3)(ii) or (c)(8)(ii) of this section, and (ii) a record of such certificates which includes the specific elevation (in relation to mean sea level) to which such structures are floodproofed shall be maintained with the official designated by the community under §59.22(a)(9)(iii);

(5) Require, for all new construction and substantial improvements, that fully enclosed areas below the lowest floor that are usable solely for parking of vehicles, building access or storage in an area other than a basement and which are subject to flooding shall be designed to automatically equalize hydrostatic flood forces on exterior walls by allowing for the entry and exit of floodwaters. Designs for meeting this requirement must either be certified by a registered professional engineer or architect or meet or exceed the following minimum criteria: A minimum of two openings having a total net area of not less than one square inch for every square foot of enclosed area subject to flooding shall be provided. The bottom of all openings shall be no higher than one foot above grade. Openings may be equipped with screens, louvers, valves, or other coverings or devices provided that they permit the automatic entry and exit of floodwaters.

(6) Require that manufactured homes that are placed or substantially improved within Zones A1-30, AH, and AE on the community’s FIRM on sites

(i) Outside of a manufactured home park or subdivision,

(ii) In a new manufactured home park or subdivision,

(iii) In an expansion to an existing manufactured home park or subdivision, or

(iv) In an existing manufactured home park or subdivision on which a manufactured home has incurred “substantial damage” as the result of a flood, be elevated on a permanent foundation such that the lowest floor of the manufactured home is elevated to or above the base flood elevation and be securely anchored to an adequately anchored foundation system to resist flotation collapse and lateral movement.

(7) Require within any AO zone on the community’s FIRM that all new construction and substantial improvements of residential structures have the lowest floor (including basement) elevated above the highest adjacent grade at least as high as the depth number specified in feet on the community’s FIRM (at least two feet if no depth number is specified);

(8) Require within any AO zone on the community’s FIRM that all new construction and substantial improvements of nonresidential structures (i) have the lowest floor (including basement) elevated above the highest adjacent grade at least as high as the depth number specified in feet on the community’s FIRM (at least two feet if no depth number is specified), or (ii) together with attendant utility and sanitary facilities be completely floodproofed to that level to meet the floodproofing standard specified in §60.3(c)(3)(ii);

(9) Require within any A99 zones on a community’s FIRM the standards of paragraphs (a)(1) through (a)(4)(i) and (b)(5) through (b)(9) of this section;
(10) Require until a regulatory floodway is designated, that no new construction, substantial improvements, or other development (including fill) shall be permitted within Zones A1-30 and AE on the community's FIRM, unless it is demonstrated that the cumulative effect of the proposed development, when combined with all other existing and anticipated development, will not increase the water surface elevation of the base flood more than one foot at any point within the community.

(11) Require within Zones AH and AO, adequate drainage paths around structures on slopes, to guide floodwaters around and away from proposed structures.

(12) Require that manufactured homes to be placed or substantially improved on sites in an existing manufactured home park or subdivision within Zones A-1-30, AH, and AE on the community's FIRM that are not subject to the provisions of paragraph (c)(6) of this section be elevated so that either

(i) The lowest floor of the manufactured home is at or above the base flood elevation, or

(ii) The manufactured home chassis is supported by reinforced piers or other foundation elements of at least equivalent strength that are no less than 36 inches in height above grade and be securely anchored to an adequately anchored foundation system to resist floatation, collapse, and lateral movement.

(13) Notwithstanding any other provisions of §60.3, a community may approve certain development in Zones A1-30, AE, and AH, on the community's FIRM which increase the water surface elevation of the base flood by more than one foot, provided that the community first applies for a conditional FIRM revision, fulfills the requirements for such a revision as established under the provisions of §65.12, and receives the approval of the Federal Insurance Administrator.

(14) Require that recreational vehicles placed on sites within Zones A1-30, AH, and AE on the community's FIRM either

(i) Be on the site for fewer than 180 consecutive days,

(ii) Be fully licensed and ready for highway use, or

(iii) Meet the permit requirements of paragraph (b)(1) of this section and the elevation and anchoring requirements for “manufactured homes” in paragraph (c)(6) of this section.

A recreational vehicle is ready for highway use if it is on its wheels or jacking system, is attached to the site only by quick disconnect type utilities and security devices, and has no permanently attached additions.

(d) When the Federal Insurance Administrator has provided a notice of final base flood elevations within Zones A1-30 and/or AE on the community's FIRM and, if appropriate, has designated AO zones, AH zones, A99 zones, and A zones on the community's FIRM, and has provided data from which the community shall designate its regulatory floodway, the community shall:

(1) Meet the requirements of paragraphs (c) (1) through (14) of this section;

(2) Select and adopt a regulatory floodway based on the principle that the area chosen for the regulatory floodway must be designed to carry the waters of the base flood, without increasing the water surface elevation of that flood more than one foot at any point;

(3) Prohibit encroachments, including fill, new construction, substantial improvements, and other development within the adopted regulatory floodway unless it has been demonstrated through hydrologic and hydraulic analyses performed in accordance with standard engineering practice that the proposed encroachment would not result in any increase in flood levels within the community during the occurrence of the base flood discharge;

(4) Notwithstanding any other provisions of §60.3, a community may permit encroachments within the adopted regulatory floodway that would result in an increase in base flood elevations, provided that the community first applies
for a conditional FIRM and floodway revision, fulfills the requirements for such revisions as established under the provisions of §65.12, and receives the approval of the Federal Insurance Administrator.

(e) When the Federal Insurance Administrator has provided a notice of final base flood elevations within Zones A1-30 and/or AE on the community's FIRM and, if appropriate, has designated AH zones, AO zones, A99 zones, and A zones on the community's FIRM, and has identified on the community's FIRM coastal high hazard areas by designating Zones V1-30, VE, and/or V, the community shall:

(1) Meet the requirements of paragraphs (c)(1) through (14) of this section;

(2) Within Zones V1-30, VE, and V on a community's FIRM, (i) obtain the elevation (in relation to mean sea level) of the bottom of the lowest structural member of the lowest floor (excluding pilings and columns) of all new and substantially improved structures, and whether or not such structures contain a basement, and (ii) maintain a record of all such information with the official designated by the community under §59.22(a)(9)(iii);

(3) Provide that all new construction within Zones V1-30, VE, and V on the community's FIRM is located landward of the reach of mean high tide;

(4) Provide that all new construction and substantial improvements in Zones V1-30 and VE, and also Zone V if base flood elevation data is available, on the community's FIRM, are elevated on pilings and columns so that (i) the bottom of the lowest horizontal structural member of the lowest floor (excluding the pilings or columns) is elevated to or above the base flood level; and (ii) the pile or column foundation and structure attached thereto is anchored to resist flotation, collapse and lateral movement due to the effects of wind and water loads acting simultaneously on all building components. Water loading values used shall be those associated with the base flood. Wind loading values used shall be those required by applicable State or local building standards. A registered professional engineer or architect shall develop or review the structural design, specifications and plans for the construction, and shall certify that the design and methods of construction to be used are in accordance with accepted standards of practice for meeting the provisions of paragraphs (e)(4) (i) and (ii) of this section.

(5) Provide that all new construction and substantial improvements within Zones V1-30, VE, and V on the community's FIRM have the space below the lowest floor either free of obstruction or constructed with non-supporting breakaway walls, open wood lattice-work, or insect screening intended to collapse under wind and water loads without causing collapse, displacement, or other structural damage to the elevated portion of the building or supporting foundation system. For the purposes of this section, a breakaway wall shall have a design safe loading resistance of not less than 10 and no more than 20 pounds per square foot. Use of breakaway walls which exceed a design safe loading resistance of 20 pounds per square foot (either by design or when so required by local or State codes) may be permitted only if a registered professional engineer or architect certifies that the designs proposed meet the following conditions:

(i) Breakaway wall collapse shall result from a water load less than that which would occur during the base flood; and,

(ii) The elevated portion of the building and supporting foundation system shall not be subject to collapse, displacement, or other structural damage due to the effects of wind and water loads acting simultaneously on all building components (structural and non-structural). Water loading values used shall be those associated with the base flood. Wind loading values used shall be those required by applicable State or local building standards.

Such enclosed space shall be usable solely for parking of vehicles, building access, or storage.

(6) Prohibit the use of fill for structural support of buildings within Zones V1-30, VE, and V on the community's FIRM;

(7) Prohibit man-made alteration of sand dunes and mangrove stands within Zones V1-30, VE, and V on the community's FIRM which would increase potential flood damage.

(8) Require that manufactured homes placed or substantially improved within Zones V1-30, V, and VE on the community's FIRM on sites
(i) Outside of a manufactured home park or subdivision,

(ii) In a new manufactured home park or subdivision,

(iii) In an expansion to an existing manufactured home park or subdivision, or

(iv) In an existing manufactured home park or subdivision on which a manufactured home has incurred “substantial damage” as the result of a flood, meet the standards of paragraphs (e)(2) through (7) of this section and that manufactured homes placed or substantially improved on other sites in an existing manufactured home park or subdivision within Zones VI-30, V, and VE on the community’s FIRM meet the requirements of paragraph (c)(12) of this section.

(9) Require that recreational vehicles placed on sites within Zones VI-30, V, and VE on the community’s FIRM either

(i) Be on the site for fewer than 180 consecutive days,

(ii) Be fully licensed and ready for highway use, or

(iii) Meet the requirements in paragraphs (b)(1) and (e) (2) through (7) of this section.

A recreational vehicle is ready for highway use if it is on its wheels or jacking system, is attached to the site only by quick disconnect type utilities and security devices, and has no permanently attached additions.

---

\[44 \text{ CFR} 59.1 \] [Definitions] “Substantial damage means damage of any origin sustained by a structure whereby the cost of restoring the structure to its before damaged condition would equal or exceed 50 percent of the market value of the structure before the damage occurred.”; Substantial improvement means any reconstruction, rehabilitation, addition, or other improvement of a structure, the cost of which equals or exceeds 50 percent of the market value of the structure before the “start of construction” of the improvement. This term includes structures which have incurred “substantial damage”, regardless of the actual repair work performed. The term does not, however, include either:

(1) Any project for improvement of a structure to correct existing violations of state or local health, sanitary, or safety code specifications which have been identified by the local code enforcement official and which are the minimum necessary to assure safe living conditions or

(2) Any alteration of a “historic structure”, provided that the alteration will not preclude the structure’s continued designation as a “historic structure”.

---

\[\text{Sec. 122-1 [Purpose] (b)} \] “The BOCC deem it in the best interest of its citizens that prudent measures be taken to minimize the potential public and private loss due to flooding. It is the intent of the BOCC that the county at all times be eligible for, and receive, the benefit of participation in the National Flood Insurance Program. It is therefore the intent of the BOCC that the provisions of this chapter be strictly adhered to in all areas of special flood hazard within the jurisdiction of the unincorporated areas of the county.”

\[\text{R322.1.8} \] Flood-resistant materials. Building materials used below the elevation required in Section R322.2 (flood hazard areas including A Zones) or R322.3 (coastal high-hazard areas including V Zones) shall comply with the following: 1. All wood, including floor sheathing, shall be pressure-preservative-treated in accordance with AWPA U1 for the species, product, preservative and end use or be the decay-resistant heartwood of redwood, black locust or cedars. Preservatives shall conform to Section 4 of AWPA U1. 2. Materials and installation methods used for flooring and interior and exterior walls and wall coverings shall conform to the provisions of FEMA/FIA–TB–2