

HPC

**Historic Preservation Commission
Monroe County
Application for Special Certificate of Appropriateness
April 06, 2026**

Staff Report

From: Thomas Francis-Siburg, Acting Planning & Development Review Manager
Date: March 17, 2026

Pigeon Key (44800 Overseas Hwy)

APPLICATION FOR SPECIAL CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS: MONROE COUNTY BOCC (FILE NO. 2026-051) IS SEEKING APPROVAL TO REPAIR AND UPGRADE THE EXISTING DOCK FACILITIES ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 44800 OVERSEAS HIGHWAY, MARATHON, WITHIN THE PIGEON KEY HISTORIC DISTRICT, HAVING PARCEL IDENTIFICATION NUMBER 00106120-000000 AND DESCRIBED ALL OF PIGEON KEY, AN ISLAND APPROXIMATELY 5.31 ACRES LOCATED AT MILE MARKER 45, ALONG THE OLD SEVEN MILE BRIDGE, LOT 1, SECTION 13, TOWNSHIP 66 SOUTH, RANGE 31 EAST, TALLAHASSEE MERIDIAN, AND DEEDED TO THE OVERSEAS ROAD AND TOLL BRIDGE DISTRICT FROM THE FLORIDA EAST COAST RAILWAY COMPANY BY DEED DATED NOVEMBER 9, 1936, AND RECORDED IN DEED RECORD G-6, PAGES 46 TO 55, AND THEREAFTER DEEDED TO MONROE COUNTY BY WARRANTY DEED, RECORDED AT OR-15, PAGES 374 TO 376, OF THE PUBLIC RECORDS OF MONROE COUNTY, FLORIDA.

History

The Pigeon Key Historic District was nominated to the National Register of Historic Places on March 16, 1990. And on December 21, 1993, through Resolution No. 524-1993, the Monroe County Board of County Commissioners (BOCC) designated Pigeon Key as a Historical and Cultural Landmark, this includes the dock.

Scope

Per the applicant, “The scope of work includes replacement of deteriorated pilings, decking, and structural framing; installation of protective pile caps; slip-resistant decking upgrades; minor plumbing and electrical reconnections; and modification of the dock entrance slope to meet ADA accessibility requirements. The only proposed expansion associated with this project is a small concrete landing pad at the upland connection point of the dock. This landing pad is required to provide a stable, ADA-compliant transition from the upland area to the dock entrance, improve public safety, and prevent erosion and undermining at the interface between the dock and shoreline.”

From the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards*

Rehabilitation (p.76)

Standard 9: “New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.”

Staff comment: *The Commission may wish to discuss the proposed upgrades to the dock and their compatibility and differentiation from the historic materials and features.*

Standard 10: “New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.”

Staff comment: *The Commission may wish to discuss the proposed upgrades to the dock and, if they were removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property.*

Resilience to Natural Hazards (p.153): “Resilience to natural hazards should be addressed as part of the treatment Rehabilitation. A historic building may have existing characteristics or features that help address or minimize the impacts of natural hazards. These should be used to best advantage and should be taken into consideration early in the planning stages of a rehabilitation project before proposing any new treatments. When new adaptive treatments are needed they should be carried out in a manner that will have the least impact on the historic character of the building, its site, and setting.”

Staff comment: *Pigeon Key is subject to the threat of damage from hurricane force winds and corrosion from seawater elements. The proposed dock upgrades will better protect the dock from natural hazards and do so with the least impact to the historic character of the site. Further, the Bureau of Historic Preservation of the Florida Department of State provided the following: “Although composite decking is not traditionally an appropriate replacement material, we know that it is in places like this where the sun, water, and salt erosion make modern wooden replacement impractical and costly.” No issues.*

Recommendation

If the Commission chooses to grant a Special Certificate of Appropriateness, Staff recommends the Commission consider the following conditions of approval:

1. The Special Certificate of Appropriateness is based on the design and placement of the proposed windows and doors as shown on the plans signed and sealed by Kyle M. Bechtelheimer, P.E., dated January 20, 2026, submitted as part of this request.
2. Work not specified may not be carried out without an additional Special Certificate of Appropriateness or Regular Certificate of Appropriateness approval. This Special Certificate of Appropriateness is only for the aforesaid project. It does not waive the required approval(s) for any future structures, modifications, or additions.
3. Due to an existing restrictive covenant for previously awarded State grant funding, a letter of coordination is required at the time of building permit submission from the State of Florida Department of Historic Resources that the scope of work is acceptable and does not violate the existing restrictive covenant of State grant funding.
4. The applicant shall apply for and receive a Building Permit for the aforesaid work. The Special Certificate of Appropriateness does not discharge, exempt, or otherwise release the applicant or his/her heir(s), assign(s), or successor(s) in title, from his/her duty to comply with any additional requirements based upon the Florida Building Code and/or floodplain design requirements.
5. The proposed scope of work has not been reviewed for compliance with/by the Monroe County Planning and Environmental Resources Department. Prior to the issuance of Building Permits, new development, modifications, and structures, shall be found in compliance with Monroe County Comprehensive Plan and the Monroe County Land Development Code.

Reference:

<https://www.nps.gov/orgs/1739/upload/treatment-guidelines-2017-part1-preservation-rehabilitation.pdf>